

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

LAWRENCE CZARNIONKA, individually  
and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE EPOCH TIMES ASSOCIATION, INC.,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:22-cv-06348-AKH

Judge Alvin K. Hellerstein

**NOTICE OF UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR  
PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT**

PLEASE TAKE NOTICE, that upon all prior pleadings and proceedings herein, and the accompanying Unopposed Motion and Memorandum of Law in Support for Preliminary Approval of Class Action Settlement and Joint Declaration of Douglas I. Cuthbertson and Hank Bates, including all exhibits attached thereto, the undersigned will move this Court before the Honorable Alvin K. Hellerstein, in Courtroom 14D of the Daniel Patrick Moynihan United States Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York, 10007, on a date to be determined by the Court, for an order: (1) provisionally certifying the Settlement Class, (2) preliminarily approving the Settlement, including all exhibits, (3) appointing Plaintiff Lawrence Czarnionka as Class Representative, (4) appointing Michael W. Sobol and Douglas I. Cuthbertson of Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein LLP; Hank Bates and Lee Lowther of Carney Bates & Pulliam PLLC; and Gary M. Klinger of Milberg Coleman Bryson Phillips Grossman, PLLC as Class Counsel, (5) appointing Kroll Settlement Administration as Settlement Administrator, (6) approving the form

and manner of Notice, (7) approving the proposed schedule of events, and (8) scheduling a Final Approval Hearing.

Dated: September 11, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Gary M. Klinger

Gary Klinger (*pro hac vice*)  
gklinger@milberg.com

**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON  
PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC**  
227 W. Monroe Street, Suite 2100  
Chicago, IL 60606  
(866) 252-0878

Douglas I. Cuthbertson (*pro hac vice*)  
dcuthbertson@lchb.com

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &  
BERNSTEIN, LLP**  
250 Hudson Street, 8th Floor  
New York, NY 10013  
Telephone: (212) 355-9500  
Facsimile: (212) 355-9592

Michael W. Sobol (SBN 194857)  
msobol@lchb.com

**LIEFF CABRASER HEIMANN &  
BERNSTEIN, LLP**  
275 Battery Street, 29th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-3339  
Telephone: (415) 956-1000  
Facsimile: (415) 956-1008

Hank Bates (SBN 167688)

hbates@cbplaw.com

Lee Lowther (*pro hac vice*)

llowther@cbplaw.com

Courtney E. Ross (*pro hac vice*)

cross@cbplaw.com

**CARNEY BATES & PULLIAM, PLLC**

519 W. 7th Street

Little Rock, AR 72201

(501) 312-8500

(501) 312-8505

Andrew J. Shamis (5195185)  
[ashamis@shamisgentile.com](mailto:ashamis@shamisgentile.com)  
Edwin E. Elliott (*pro hac vice*)  
[edwine@shamisgentile.com](mailto:edwine@shamisgentile.com)  
**SHAMIS & GENTILE, P.A.**  
14 NE 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue, Suite 705  
Miami, FL 33132  
(305) 479-2299

*Attorneys for Plaintiff Lawrence Czarnionka  
and the Proposed Class*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that on this 11th day of September 2023, a true and correct copy of the foregoing was served in accordance with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure via CM/ECF on all counsel of record.

**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON  
PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC**

/s/ Gary M. Klinger  
Gary M. Klinger

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

LAWRENCE CZARNIONKA, individually  
and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE EPOCH TIMES ASSOCIATION, INC.,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:22-cv-06348-AKH

Judge Alvin K. Hellerstein

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

NOTICE OF UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

UNOPPOSED MOTION AND MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT FOR PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT

DECLARATION OF DOUGLAS CUTHBERTSON AND HANK BATES

EXHIBIT 1: Settlement Agreement

EXHIBIT 2: Declaration of Jeanne C. Finegan, APR of Kroll

EXHIBIT 3: Firm Resume of Carney Bates & Pulliam, PLLC

EXHIBIT 4: Firm Resume of Milberg Coleman Bryson Phillips Grossman PLLC

EXHIBIT 5: Firm Resume of Shamis & Gentile, P.A.

EXHIBIT 6: Firm Resume of Edelsberg Law